



Investigating the CPA Managers' Hiring Preferences in the Selection of Accounting Professionals in Davao City

John Lie C. Votacion

Operations Audit Section, Philippine Seven Corporation, Philippines

Enrico C. Yee, Jr.*

Faculty, University of Southeastern Philippines, Philippines

[*Corresponding author]

Abstract

The purpose of this paper is to explore the attribute preferences of CPA managers in the selection of accounting professionals in Davao City using conjoint analysis. The study is conducted to get an understanding of the expectations of CPA managers that can help provide guidelines to accounting professionals in acquiring good employment opportunities. Based on the conjoint analysis technique, a questionnaire was designed, and responses were recorded for the 55 CPA managers who answered by rating the hypothetical designs based on their perceived attractiveness for employment.

Results show that CPA managers find integrity to be the most important Attribute related to employability, followed by ethical skills. Even though the sample respondents have varied preferences on what is considered as the most and least attributes in selecting accounting professionals, they still prefer applicants to have the highest levels of attributes. Results of the Levene's test showed that the test of assumption of homoscedasticity is not violated for each demographic variable. However, Analysis of variance and Independent samples t-test results show that respondents whose age bracket 30 to 39 have significantly higher preference compared to other age brackets. It is therefore recommended that accounting professionals improve their integrity to acquire good employment opportunities and for the educational institutions to develop employability skills of their students. Additionally, further studies should be conducted to appropriately determine the preference in terms of employability skills, especially those involving higher survey participants.

Keywords

CPA Managers' Hiring Preferences, Selection of Accounting Professionals in Davao City

INTRODUCTION

The purpose of the research study is to discover the hiring preferences of CPA managers and determine the most important attributes in the selection of accounting professionals in Davao City. The results presented in this study will contribute valuable inputs on how CPA managers prioritize the collective attributes of an accounting professional based on their importance.

The recruitment and selection process involves several activities including looking over applications, selecting candidates, and interviewing candidates. Additionally, the Human Resource department is working closely with the hiring managers in determining the qualifications required for a specific role.

Hiring managers are able to truly understand what a role entails and the kinds of skills an employee needs to perform the job successfully. This makes the applicant's attributes vital as employers look at them when deciding the candidate's suitability for the company and the specific role. This is also true with Certified Public Accountant (CPA) managers to ensure that the work performed by the team of accounting professionals complies with regulations and quality control standards.

The job-specific skills that graduates once possessed are no longer adequate to fill open positions in the labor markets of the twenty-first century. What they need is employability skills. Employability skills are a group of abilities and traits that modern-day workers must possess to increase their capacity to find and keep employment and advance professionally (Fajaryati et al., 2020).

The need for employability skills in the local, national, and worldwide labor markets has increased significantly (Micabalo et al., 2021). According to Smith (2023), an HR technology company named TestGorilla stated that most businesses (76%) use skills-based recruiting to fill available positions, and more than half (55%) use role-specific skills tests to screen candidates. These figures are from the 2022 poll conducted among 2,736 employers in different nations. However, based on the observation and data analysis conducted by LinkedIn (2023), the skills required by employers are constantly changing depending on the demands of the hiring managers.

According to Bayudan-Dacuycuy (2021), banking and finance are hard-to-fill jobs that require specific skills and substantially higher analytical skills than those of the in-demand jobs. However, Briones et al. (2021) and Micabalo et al. (2021), stated the talents that entail interacting with other people are those that employers value the most in the national, regional, and global labor markets.

According to Philippine Statistics Authority (PSA), the Philippines' employment rate was at 95.5 percent in April 2023 wherein only 5.2 percent and 5.7 percent are managers and professionals, respectively (PSA, 2023). Briones et al. (2021) stated that globalization and technological growth have continuously changed how firms plan and operate, which includes human resource functions. The need for human capital may alter in order to adapt to the shifting business climate.

In the year 2022, PSA reported that Region XI and Davao City have an employment rate of 96 percent and 95.8 percent, respectively (PSA, 2022). Based on the job and labor market forecast for 2022-2025 of the Department of Labor and Employment (2023), accounting personnel were among those in-demand occupations in Davao Region. Additionally, occupations involving accounting professionals like accountants, accounting staff, and auditors were listed as hard-to-fill jobs aside from being in demand. One of the reasons stated for the said situation was the lack of qualified applicants having the skill requirements for the job.

Based on available studies reviewed, different viewpoints are presented on what factor is more relevant today. Based on the employment data gathered, accounting professional occupations are hard-to-fill due to the lack of qualified applicants. According to Briones et al. (2021), conducting tracer research on the pertinent traits that employers of today will help address the employment mismatch. This research will contribute to determining the skills needed by employers so it can assist accounting professionals in what areas to improve to enter the workforce. The researcher would want to continue the investigation of this study in this manner.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The descriptive-experimental design has been adopted in this study. The experimental conjoint was used to obtain the preferences, in the form of orthogonal design, of the CPA Managers in the selection of accounting professionals in Davao City. Participants in this approach must complete a series of evaluations based on a fixed set of attributes (Block et al., 2019). To determine if there are any significant differences in the identified job attributes preferred by CPA managers when grouped according to their demographic profile, the descriptive design is used in this study. The descriptive design aims to identify the traits of a certain person, circumstance, or group and only the results will be reported by the researcher, who has no direct influence over the factors (Mishra & Alok, 2022).

According to Maer Matei et al. (2023), conjoint method can be used to measure employers' preferences regarding the skills of their desired candidates. This study considered the skill combination of applicants as a service product to be sold to potential employers and hiring managers and the attributes with corresponding levels are the features that an employer will earn when the applicant is hired.

This research design was used to determine the effects of the four attributes: integrity, analytical and critical thinking skills, ethical skills, and work experience in investigating the CPA managers' hiring preferences in the selection of accounting professionals in Davao City.

The primary sources of data came from the responses of the CPA managers involved in the recruitment decision of accounting professionals in Davao City.

Nine (9) attributes were identified which generated 19,683 combinations using factorial design (3x3x3x3x3x3x3x3x3). According to Adamowicz et al. (1998), more attribute levels would provide increased in-depth insights into attribute preferences, however, this would need more profile cards and complicate the consistency of responses. Therefore, the total number of attributes and their levels should be minimized to reduce respondents' burden (Kim et al., 2020).

To address the issue and determine the important attributes to measure when determining preferences, an initial survey was conducted (Zubey et al., 2002). A self-administered questionnaire (Appendix B) was distributed to CPA managers and human resource personnel outside Davao City, as key informants, using complete enumeration sampling method. Based on the result, 19 responses were received and used as sample representatives to select the four (4) most preferred attributes from the list of nine (9) (work experience, ethical skills, integrity, analytical and critical thinking skills, leadership skills, communication and interpersonal skills, digital skills, business acumen, and teamwork) attributes. The 19 respondents for the initial survey were decided upon consultation with the researcher's adviser. The respondents were CPA managers and human resource personnel of different accounting firms located outside Davao City.

The four (4) most preferred attributes by key informants (integrity, analytical and critical thinking skills, ethical skills, and work experience) became the basis for the 9 hypothetical designs (Appendix C) of an accounting professional in Davao City.

The main respondents of the study were CPA managers involved in the recruitment decisions of accounting professionals located in Davao City.

This study has utilized the complete enumeration sampling to determine the result of the study. Under complete enumeration sampling, the information is collected from each unit of the population or universe. According to Surapaneni et al. (2021), complete enumeration sampling would allow the researchers to study multiple aspects of all items of the population and obtain data from every unit of the population resulting in data that is reliable, accurate, and truly representative of the whole population. Complete enumeration is not possible when the population is large due to reliability of data, budget, time, and manpower constraints (Arnab, 2017). A smaller survey that is well-conducted can prevent errors and produce higher-quality data when using complete enumeration sampling (Australian Bureau of Statistics, 1999).

RESULTS

This study was conducted to determine the hiring preferences of CPA managers in the selection of accounting professionals in Davao City using conjoint analysis.

The study wanted to: First, know the social background and status of the hiring CPA Managers who served as respondents to the study according to their profile: age bracket, educational attainment, sex at birth and work experience; Second, identify the attributes of an accounting professional that form part of the preference structure of the respondents; Third, find out the relative importance of each attribute in forming a preference for an accounting professional in Davao City such as integrity, analytical and critical thinking skills, ethical skills and work experience; Fourth, look into the utility values that CPA managers attach to the different attributes forming the preference structure for an accounting professional; and Fifth, establish if there is a significant difference in the preferences of the CPA managers in the selection of accounting professionals Davao City when grouped according to demographic profile.

A survey was conducted to determine the demographic profile of respondents and preferences by ranking the nine (9) design combinations generated using statistical software. The respondents were CPA managers involved in the hiring process of professionals in Davao City. Fifty-five (55) respondents participated in the study, and 100 percent or all were included in the analysis.

The profile of the respondents showed that most of the CPA managers are within the 30- to 39-year-old age bracket, representing 47.27 percent. Most of the respondents have bachelor's degree with CPA license forming 54.55 percent of the population. The profile according to sex at birth revealed that 61.82 percent or 34 out of 55 are females.

Based on literature, nine (9) attributes of an accounting professional were initially identified namely: work experience, ethical skills, integrity, analytical and critical thinking skills, leadership skills, communication and interpersonal skills, digital skills, business acumen, and teamwork. To reduce the number of attributes to a manageable number, a survey questionnaire was administered to human resource personnel and CPA managers outside Davao City to identify the four (4) most preferred attributes.

Results of the study showed that CPA managers considered the following as the most important attributes: a) Integrity (34.405); b) Ethical skills (29.352); c) Work experience (18.700); and d) Analytical and critical thinking skills (17.542).

The outcome of the importance values rating of the sample individual respondents exhibited a difference in some of their most and least preferred attributes.

On the aggregate model, the preferred design model of CPA managers was characterized by the following attributes and levels: (a) Integrity – above average; (b) Ethical skills – above average; (c) Analytical and critical thinking skills – above average and (e) Work experience – 4 years and above.

The study made use of the assumption that there is a significant difference in the preferences of the hiring managers in the selection of accounting professionals in Davao City when grouped according to demographic profile.

Analysis of Variance and Independent T-Test were used to test if there is a significant difference in the hiring preferences of CPA managers when grouped according to profile.

Results showed that the age bracket has a significant difference on respondent's preference.

CONCLUSIONS

It is important to understand the preference structures of employers when selecting applicants to avoid job mismatches and identify what skills you need to acquire and what areas to develop to be marketable in the eyes of the employers.

Though there are skills that continue to be relevant and sought out by employers, there are factors like digitalization and cybernation that affect how employers look at the qualifications of an applicant. Thus, it is important to conduct tracer studies to close the knowledge gap in the employment mismatch. Eliminating job mismatches results in better hiring for businesses and helps job seekers discover more career fulfillment, which boosts productivity and employee satisfaction in the workplace over the long run.

The four (4) attributes: integrity, ethical skills, work experience, and critical and analytical thinking skills are the most preferred attributes of the hiring CPA managers that form part of their preference structure.

These attributes are all important in determining the hiring preferences of CPA managers in the selection of accounting professionals in Davao. However, the result of this study indicated that the most important attribute is “integrity” and the least important attribute is “analytical and critical thinking skills”.

Based on the findings, only the age bracket has a significant difference in the CPA managers' preference in selecting an accounting professional in Davao City. Other demographic variables such as educational attainment, sex at birth, and work experience have no impact on the preference of CPA managers in the selection of accounting professionals in Davao City.

FUNDING DECLARATION

This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

DECLARATION OF CONFLICT

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

REFERENCES

1. Accountant. (n.d.) In Cambridge Dictionary. Retrieved August 7, 2023, from <https://dictionary.cambridge.org/us/dictionary/english/accountant>
2. Adamowicz, W., Louviere, J., & Swait, J. (1998). Introduction to attribute-based stated choice methods.
3. AICPA, & CIMA. (2019). Future re-inventing finance for a digital world (pp. 1–44). <https://www.cgma.org/content/dam/cgma/resources/reports/downloadabledocuments/future-re-inventing-finance-for-a-digital-world.pdf>
4. Alhendi, O. (2019). Personality traits and their validity in predicting job performance at recruitment: a review. *International Journal of Engineering and Management Sciences (IJEMS)* Vol, 4.
5. Aliu, J., & Aigbavboa, C. (2023). Key generic skills for employability of built environment graduates. *International Journal of Construction Management*, 23(3), 542-552.
6. Aria, M., Balbi, S., Balzano, S., & Piscitelli, A. (2019). The ideal candidates for the hotel industry vacancies: a conjoint analysis of managers' preferences. *Statistica Applicata-Italian Journal of Applied Statistics*, (3), 299-316.
7. Armstrong, M., (2009). *A Handbook of Human Resource Management Practice*. 11th ed. London: Kogan Ltd.
8. Arnab, R. (2017). *Survey sampling theory and applications*. Academic Press.
9. Aryanti, C., & Adhariani, D. (2020). Students' perceptions and expectation gap on the skills and knowledge of accounting graduates. *The Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business (JAFEB)*, 7(9), 649-657.
10. Australian Bureau of Statistics. (1999). *An Introduction to sample surveys : a user's guide*. Canberra : Australian Bureau of Statistics <http://www.abs.gov.au/ausstats/abs@.nsf/cat/1299.0>
11. Backhaus, K., Erichson, B., Gensler, S., Weiber, R., & Weiber, T. (2021). *Multivariate analysis*. Springer Books.
12. Bag, S., Pretorius, J. H. C., Gupta, S., & Dwivedi, Y. K. (2021). Role of institutional pressures and resources in the adoption of big data analytics powered artificial intelligence, sustainable manufacturing practices and circular economy capabilities. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 163, 120420.
13. Baird, A. M., & Parayitam, S. (2019). Employers' ratings of importance of skills and competencies college graduates need to get hired: Evidence from the New England region of USA. *Education+ Training*, 61(5), 622-634.
14. Baker, W. M., & McGregor, C. C. (2000). Empirically assessing the importance of characteristics of accounting students. *Journal of Education for Business*, 75(3), 149-157.
15. Bala, R. & Singh, S. (2021). Employability skills of management students: A study of teacher's viewpoint. *Materials Today: Proceedings*, 80(3), 1727-1730.
16. Barney, J. (1991). Firm resources and sustained competitive advantage. *Journal of management*, 17(1), 99-120.
17. Bayudan-Dacuycuy, C., & Dacuycuy, L. B. (2021). Labor market structures, pay gap, and skills in the Philippines (No. 2021-28). PIDS Discussion Paper Series.
18. Becker, G. S. (2002). The age of human capital. *Education in the twenty-first century*. - Stanford, Calif. : Hoover Institution Press, ISBN 0-8179-2892-8. - 2002, p. 3-8
19. Bhoj, S., Bardhan, D., & Kumar, A. (2013). Strengthening credit services to livestock sector for inclusive rural growth. *Journal of Rural Development*, 367-381.
20. Block, J., Fisch, C., Vismara, S., & Andres, R. (2019). Private equity investment criteria: An experimental conjoint analysis of venture capital, business angels, and family offices. *Journal of corporate finance*, 58, 329-352.
21. Bolander, P., & Sandberg, J. (2013). How employee selection decisions are made in practice. *Organization Studies*, 34(3), 285-311.
22. Briones, G. B., Apat, E. J. C., Lorica, D. G. I. R., & Valenzuela, M. P. (2021). Employers' Preference on Employability Skills of Business Management and Accounting Graduates. *International Journal of Academe and Industry Research*, 2(3), 64-85.
23. Caglio, A., Cameran, M., & Klobas, J. (2019). What is an accountant? An investigation of images. *European Accounting Review*, 28(5), 849-871.
24. Castillo, R. C. (2017). Performance of an accountancy school in certified public accountant licensure examinations in the Philippines. *International Journal of Advanced Research and Publications*, 1(4), 226-32.
25. Cattin, P., & Wittink, D. R. (1982). Commercial use of conjoint analysis: A survey. *Journal of marketing*, 46(3), 44-53.
26. Chatzoglou, P., Chatzoudes, D., Sarigiannidis, L., & Theriou, G. (2018). The role of firm-specific factors in the strategy-performance relationship. *Management Research Review*, 41(1), 46–73. doi:10.1108/mrr-10-2016-0243
27. Cornell, D. W., & Arora, R. (1998). Preparing Staff Accountants for the Changing Business World-Importance Of Skills. *Journal Of Customer Service In Marketing & Management*, 4(2), 77-93.

28. De Guzman, M. J. J., Abalos, C. M., Cabaluna, C. M. M., & Ventayen, R. J. M. (2020). Tracer Study on the Employability of Business Administration Graduates (2017-2019) of Pangasinan State University Lingayen Campus. *ASEAN Journal of Basic and Higher Education*, 3.
29. Department of Labor and Employment. (2023). Preliminary Jobs and Labor Market Forecast 2022-2025. <https://ble.dole.gov.ph/preliminary-jobs-and-labor-market-forecast-2022-2025/>
30. Di Gregorio, A., Maggioni, I., Mauri, C., & Mazzucchelli, A. (2019). Employability skills for future marketing professionals. *European management journal*, 37(3), 251-258.
31. Diokno, C. O. B., & Peprah, W. K. (2021). Application of Technical and Soft Skills in the First Job Experience by Accountancy Graduates in the Philippines: Implications for Accounting Curriculum Development. *Open Journal of Accounting*, 10(3), 111-124.
32. Eggers, F., Sattler, H., Teichert, T., & Völckner, F. (2021). Choice-Based conjoint analysis. In *Handbook of market research* (pp. 781-819). Cham: Springer International Publishing.
33. Fajaryati, N., Budiyo, Akhyar, M., & Wiranto. (2020). The employability skills needed to face the demands of work in the future: Systematic literature reviews. *Open Engineering*, 10(1), 595-603.
34. Felix, R. B. (2021). Analyzing the importance of integrity and honesty in our society as moral values.
35. Ferial, R. M. (2021). The Influence of Integrity on Employee Performance. *Asian Journal of Behavioural Sciences*, 3(1), 97-104.
36. Galiakberova, A. A. (2019). Conceptual analysis of education role in economics: The human capital theory. *Journal of History Culture and Art Research*, 8(3), 410-421.
37. Green, P. E., & Srinivasan, V. (1990). Conjoint analysis in marketing: new developments with implications for research and practice. *Journal of marketing*, 54(4), 3-19.
38. Griffin, M., & Coelho, P. (2019). Business students' perspectives on employability skills post internship experience: Lessons from the UAE. *Higher Education, Skills and Work-Based Learning*, 9(1), 60-75.
39. Guerrero-Dib, J. G., Portales, L., & Heredia-Escorza, Y. (2020). Impact of academic integrity on workplace ethical behaviour. *International Journal for Educational Integrity*, 16(1), 1-18.
40. Guzmán, V. E., Muschard, B., Gerolamo, M., Kohl, H., & Rozenfeld, H. (2020). Characteristics and Skills of Leadership in the Context of Industry 4.0. *Procedia Manufacturing*, 43, 543-550.
41. Hair, J. F., Black, W. C., Babin, B. J., & Anderson, R. E. (2009). *Multivariate Data Analysis*, 7e, pp. 408-449
42. Hart, S. L. (1995). A natural-resource-based view of the firm. *Academy of management review*, 20(4), 986-1014.
43. Herbert, W. E., Tsegba, I. N., Ene, E. E., & Onyilo, F. (2017). The rise of fraud examination and forensic accounting in Africa: the Nigerian experience. *Archives of Business Research*, 5(4).
44. Hossain, M. M., Alam, M., Alamgir, M., & Salat, A. (2020). Factors affecting business graduates' employability—empirical evidence using partial least squares (PLS). *Education+ Training*, 62(3), 292-310.
45. Huang, M. H., Rust, R., & Maksimovic, V. (2019). The feeling economy: Managing in the next generation of artificial intelligence (AI). *California Management Review*, 61(4), 43-65.
46. Huber, J., Wittink, D. R., Johnson, R. M., & Miller, R. (1992, July). Learning effects in preference tasks: Choice-based versus standard conjoint. In *Sawtooth Software Conference Proceedings* (pp. 275-282). Sequim, WA: Sawtooth Software, Inc.
47. IFAC. (2019). Future-fit accountants: CFO & Finance function roles for the next decade (p. 16). International Federation of Accountants. ISBN 978-1-60815-418-0. <https://www.ifac.org/knowledge-gateway/preparing-future-ready-professionals/publications/future-fit-accountants-roles-next-decade>
48. IMA. (2019). IMA management accounting competency framework. Institute of Management Accountants. <https://www.imanet.org/career-resources/management-accounting-competencies?ssopc=1>.
49. International Federation of Accountants (IFAC). (2005). The Roles and Domain of the Professional Accountant in Business. <https://www.ifac.org/knowledge-gateway/preparing-future-ready-professionals/publications/roles-and-domain-professional-accountant-business>
50. Jackson, D., & Tomlinson, M. (2022). The relative importance of work experience, extra-curricular and university-based activities on student employability. *Higher Education Research & Development*, 41(4), 1119-1135.
51. Jin, Y., & Park, Y. (2019). An integrated approach to determining rural tourist satisfaction factors using the IPA and conjoint analysis. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 16(20), 3848.
52. Karima, R. D., Setiadi, R., & Siswantining, T. (2020). Preference analysis of determining jobs using conjoint analysis. In *Journal of Physics: Conference Series* (Vol. 1442, No. 1, p. 012040). IOP Publishing.
53. Kenayathulla, H. B., Ahmad, N. A., & Idris, A. R. (2019). Gaps between competence and importance of employability skills: evidence from Malaysia. *Higher Education Evaluation and Development*, 13(2), 97-112.
54. Kotri, A. (2006). Analyzing customer value using conjoint analysis: The example of a packaging company.
55. Kucharčíková, A., Mičiak, M., & Hitka, M. (2018). Evaluating the effectiveness of investment in human capital in e-business enterprise in the context of sustainability. *Sustainability*, 10(9), 3211.
56. LinkedIn 2023 Most In-Demand Skills: Learn the Skills Companies Need Most. (2023, February 20). LinkedIn.com. <https://www.linkedin.com/business/learning/blog/top-skills-and-courses/most-in-demand-skills>
57. Louviere, J. J., & Woodworth, G. (1983). Design and analysis of simulated consumer choice or allocation experiments: an approach based on aggregate data. *Journal of marketing research*, 20(4), 350-367.
58. Maer Matei, M. M., Zamfir, A. M., & Mocanu, C. (2023). Criteria Weights in Hiring Decisions—A Conjoint Approach. *Mathematics*, 11(3), 728.
59. Mansuy, J., Verlinde, S., & Macharis, C. (2020). Understanding preferences for EEE collection services: A choice-based conjoint analysis. *Resources, Conservation and Recycling*, 161, 104899.
60. Mariani, P., Marletta, A., & Zenga, M. (2019). What do employers look for when hiring new graduates? Answers from the electus survey. In *New Statistical Developments in Data Science: SIS 2017*, Florence, Italy, June 28-30 (pp. 359-372). Springer International Publishing.

61. McDonald, P., Stewart, A., & Oliver, D. (2021). Challenging the assumptions supporting work experience as a pathway to employment. *Internships, Employability and the Search for Decent Work Experience*, 76-90.
62. Mendoza, R. R. (2013). Continuing Professional Development in Public Accountancy Practice: The Philippine Experience. *South East Asia Journal of Contemporary Business, Economics and Law*, 2(1).
63. Micabalo, K., Poliquit, W. M., Ibanez, E., Cartalla, K. F., & Calimpong, R. (2021). Accounting Skills in Practice and Their Impact on Employability: A Curriculum Review in an Autonomous Philippine University. *JPAIR Institutional Research*, 17(1), 76-94.
64. Mishra, S. B., & Alok, S. (2017). *Handbook of Research Methodology*. Educreation.
65. Mojambo, G., Tulung, J. E., & Saerang, R. T. (2020). The influence of Top Management Team (TMT) characteristics toward Indonesian Banks performance during the digital era (2014–2018). Available at SSRN 3541856.
66. Moore, W. L. (1980). Levels of Aggregation in Conjoint Analysis: An Empirical Comparison. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 17(4), 516–523.
67. Murzi, H. G., Chowdhury, T. M., Karlovšek, J., & Ulloa, B. R. (2020). Working in large teams: Measuring the impact of a teamwork model to facilitate teamwork development in engineering students working in a real project. *International Journal of Engineering Education*, 36(1), 274-295.
68. NACE (2017). Job outlook 2018. <https://www.naceweb.org/career-readiness/competencies/the-four-career-competencies-employers-value-most/>
69. National Council for Excellence in Critical Thinking. (1987). Defining Critical Thinking. <https://www.criticalthinking.org/pages/defining-critical-thinking/766>
70. Ngah, A., Kamalrulzaman, N., Ibrahim, F., Osman, N., & Ariffin, N. (2021). The effect of soft skills, ethics, and value on the willingness of employers to continue recruiting UMT graduates. *Management Science Letters*, 11(5), 1689-1698.
71. Ohei, K. N., Brink, R., & Abiodun, A. (2019). Information and Communication Technology (ICT) graduates and challenges of employability: A conceptual framework for enhancing employment opportunities in South Africa. *Gender and Behaviour*, 17(3), 13500-13521.
72. Ong, A. K. S., Prasetyo, Y. T., Esteller, A. J. D., Bruno, J. E., Lagorza, K. C. O., Oli, L. E. T., ... & Nadlifatin, R. (2023). Consumer preference analysis on the attributes of samgyeopsal Korean cuisine and its market segmentation: Integrating conjoint analysis and K-means clustering. *Plos One*, 18(2), e0281948.
73. Paalanen, T., & Hopia, H. (n.d.). Introduction to Professional Ethics | Study material for the master students. <https://oppimateriaalit.jamk.fi/ethics/>
74. Philippine Statistics Authority. (2022). 2022 Annual Provincial Labor Market Statistics (Preliminary Results). <https://psa.gov.ph/system/files/iesd/Table%202.%20Total%20Employed%20Persons%20and%20Employment%20Rate%202021f%20and%202022p.xlsx>
75. Philippine Statistics Authority. (2023). Unemployment Rate in April 2023 is Estimated at 4.5 Percent: Press Release. https://psa.gov.ph/system/files/iesd/Press%20Release%20for%20April%202023%20LFS_0.pdf
76. Professional Regulation Commission. (2017). Increase in Required CPD Units and Change of Thematic Areas to Competence Areas for All CPAs. <https://www.prc.gov.ph/article/increase-required-cpd-units-and-change-thematic-areas-competence-areas-all-cpas/746>
77. Professional Regulation Commission. (2019). Amending Relevant Provisions of Resolution No. 1032 (s. 2017) otherwise known as the "Implementing Rules and Regulations (IRR) of Republic Act No. 10912 known as the Continuing Professional Development (CPD) Act of 2016". <https://www.prc.gov.ph/sites/default/files/2019-1146%20CPD%20IRR.PDF>
78. Poortinga, W., Steg, L., Vlek, C., & Wiersma, G. B. (2003). Household preferences for energy-saving measures: A conjoint analysis. *Journal of Economic Psychology*, 24(1), 49–64. DOI:10.1016/s0167-4870(02)00154-x
79. Rahim, N. A. A. B. A., Omar, K. B., & Azzahra, S. N. A. (2020). Integrity and employee job performance. *Journal of Critical Reviews*, 7(16), 517-521.
80. Ranasingha, R. G. S. M., Edirisinghe, J. C., & Ratnayake, R. H. M. K. (2019). Willingness to pay for fruit attributes: a conjoint analysis.
81. Ratnawati, E., Sukidjo, S., & Efendi, R. (2020). The effect of work motivation and work experience on employee performance. *International Journal of Multicultural and Multireligious Understanding*, 7(8), 109-116.
82. Rebele, J. E., & Pierre, E. K. S. (2019). A commentary on learning objectives for accounting education programs: The importance of soft skills and technical knowledge. *Journal of Accounting Education*, 48, 71-79.
83. Rosen, S. (1989). Human capital. In *Social economics* (pp. 136-155). London: Palgrave Macmillan UK.
84. Rosita, R., & RS, T. Y. (2019). The effect of burnout, work experience, and work motivation on employee performance with emotional intelligence as variable moderation. *Journal of Business Studies*, 4(1), 67-81.
85. Rosmi, R., & Syamsir, S. (2020). The Influence of Integrity and Work Experience on Employee Performance. *International Journal of Research and Analytical Reviews (IJRAR)*, 7(1), 789-794.
86. Rufino, H., Payabyab, R. G., & Lim, G. T. (2017). Competency requirements for professional accountants: Basis for accounting curriculum enhancement. *Review of Integrative Business and Economics Research*, 7.
87. Smith, M. (2023). The 10 most in-demand skills employers want to see on your resume right now. CNBC. <https://www.cnbc.com/2023/02/15/most-in-demand-skills-employers-want-to-see-on-your-resume.html>
88. Solomons, D., (1978) "The Politicisation of Accounting", in Jones, S., Romano C., and Ratnutunga, J. eds (1995) *Accounting Theory; a contemporary review*, Harcourt Brace, pp 225-235.
89. Suarta, I. M., Suwintana, I. K., Sudhana, I. F. P., & Hariyanti, N. K. D. (2019, November). Students and vocational educators perceived on the importance level of employability skills. In *International Conference on Social Science 2019 (ICSS 2019)* (pp. 1131-1140). Atlantis Press.
90. Succi, C., & Canovi, M. (2020). Soft skills to enhance graduate employability: comparing students and employers' perceptions. *Studies in higher education*, 45(9), 1834-1847.

91. Sugiarti, E., Finatariani, E., & Rahman, Y. T. (2021). Earning Cultural Values as A Strategic Step to Improve Employee Performance. *SCIENTIFIC JOURNAL OF REFLECTION: Economic, Accounting, Management and Business*, 4(1), 221-230.
92. Surapaneni, K. M., Kaur, M., Kaur, R., Grover, A., & Joshi, A. (2021). The impact of COVID-19 vaccine communication, acceptance, and practices (CO-VIN-CAP) on vaccine hesitancy in an Indian setting: Protocol for a cross-sectional study. *JMIR research protocols*, 10(6), e29733.
93. Susada, B. L. (2018). A students' preference on mathematics classroom using conjoint analysis. *Asian Journal of Multidisciplinary Studies*, 1(1), 87-95.
94. Syamsir, S., & Embi, M. A. (2020). Integrity Development through PSM for Corruption Prevention among Public Servant (First Author). *International Journal of Psychosocial Rehabilitation*, 24(8), 1437-1448.
95. Taylor, R. N. (1975). Age and experience as determinants of managerial information processing and decision making performance. *Academy of Management journal*, 18(1), 74-81.
96. Tenedero, P. P. P. (2017). Accounting Students' Perspective of Work-Relevant Communication Skills: Evidence from a Philippine University. *Journal on English Language Teaching*, 7(1), 30-42.
97. Thomas, H., Smith, R. R., & Diez, F. (2013). *Human capital and global business strategy*. Cambridge University Press.
98. Tsiligiris, V., & Bowyer, D. (2021). Exploring the impact of 4IR on skills and personal qualities for future accountants: a proposed conceptual framework for university accounting education. *Accounting Education*, 30(6), 621-649.
99. Utami, H., & Alamanos, E. (2022). *Resource-Based Theory: A review*. S. Papagiannidis. TheoryHub Book. open. ncl. ac. uk.
100. van Laar, E., van Deursen, A. J., van Dijk, J. A., & de Haan, J. (2019). Determinants of 21st-century digital skills: A large-scale survey among working professionals. *Computers in human behavior*, 100, 93-104.
101. Van Slyke, C., Clary, G., Ellis, S., & Maasberg, M. (2019, June). Employer preferences for cybersecurity skills among information systems graduates. In *Proceedings of the 2019 on Computers and People research Conference* (pp. 131-134).
102. Verawati, Y., & Widyawati, S. R. (2019). The Role Of Competence Mediates The Effect Of Work Experience Of Employee Performance In Dinas Pertanian, Ketahanan Pangan Dan Perikanan, Bangli Regency. *Academy of Social Science Journal*, 4(11), 1517-1522.
103. Walker, K. E., & Biginas, K. (2021). Are You the Real Deal? The Art and Science of Human Capital due Diligence. *Onresearch*, 6, 102.
104. Wells, P. K. (2019). How does contact with accountants influence perceptions of accounting?. *Accounting Education*, 28(2), 127-148.
105. Weatherly, Leslie. (2003). *Human Capital— The Elusive Asset Measuring and Managing Human Capital: A Strategic Imperative for HR*.
106. Wyatt, A. R. (2004). Accounting professionalism—They just don't get it!. *Accounting horizons*, 18(1), 45-53.
107. Yolanda, N. M., & Syamsir, S. (2020). The Influence of Integrity on the Performance of Civil Servants (PNS) in the Regional Organization of the Organization of the City of Padang. *Journal of Perspective-Journal of Sociology and Education Studies*, 3(1), 70-77.
108. Zubey, M. L., Wagner, W., & Otto, J. R. (2002). A conjoint analysis of voice over IP attributes. *Internet Research*, 12(1), 7-15.